

CITY OF NAPA CITY COUNCIL
AGENDA REPORT

PUBLIC HEARING
AGENDA ITEM 15.A.
Date: April 15, 2014

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of City Council
From: Rick Tooker, Community Development Director
Prepared by: Karlo Felix, Associate Planner
Subject: Rubenstein Subdivision – Application to subdivide a 1.42 acre property at 47 Garfield Lane into eight single-family lots.

ISSUE STATEMENT:

Adopt a resolution to approve a Use Permit to authorize the use of Flag Lot Development Standards, a Design Review Permit for a subdivision map, flag lots, and house plans, and a Tentative Map to subdivide a 1.42 acre property into eight single-family lots and consideration of a determination that the Recommended Action is exempt from CEQA pursuant to 15332 of the CEQA Guidelines.

DISCUSSION:

The applicant proposes to subdivide the subject 1.42 acre property into eight single-family homes. The lots would be accessed from a new street off Garfield Lane. Lot sizes range from 5,252 square feet to 7,453 square feet. House plans for the development include a total of three models ranging in size from 1,868 square feet to 2,496 square feet.

Site Context:

The project site is located on the south-side of Garfield Lane between Culbertson Court and Old Vine Way. The property is generally flat and has a 2,845 square foot single-family home. Adjacent uses are exclusively residential with single-family detached homes to the north, south, and west and single-family attached homes to the east.

General Plan:

The property is located within the SFI-33G, Single-Family Infill General Plan Designation, which allows for detached and attached single-family homes at a density of six to nine units per acre. The subdivision of the 1.42 acre project site into eight lots would result in an overall density of six units per acre which is consistent with the density range of this Designation.

Housing Element Policy H1.1 encourages the efficient use of land. The proposed eight-lot subdivision has been appropriately designed to achieve a density that is within this

range on an underutilized parcel of land, consistent with Policy H1.1. Land Use Element Policy LU-4.5 encourages projects to be compatible with the surrounding neighborhood. The proposed single-family use is consistent with existing developments in the area consistent with this policy.

Zoning:

The property is located within the RI-4, Single-Family Infill Zoning District, which permits residential development with a minimum lot size of 4,000 square feet. The applicant proposes to utilize the Pedestrian-Friendly Street Standards as established in Section 17.52.360 of the Zoning Ordinance which allows the dwelling living areas to be within 10 feet of the back edge of sidewalk.

All of the proposed lots satisfy the minimum lot size and the development standards of the RI-4 District and the Pedestrian-Friendly Street Standards.

Flag Lot Development Standards:

Lots 4 and 5 propose to utilize flag lot development standards as provided for by Section 17.52.190 of the Zoning Ordinance. These standards allow for variations to the standards of the base district and provide additional requirements to ensure adequate parking and access to the lots. Lots 4 and 5 are accessed at the terminus of the new street through individual driveways 21 feet in width. Flag lots are required to provide one additional on-site parking space to accommodate the parking space normally located on the street. Additionally, driveways are required to be designed to allow for forward entry onto the street. The configuration of the proposed flag lots, the building envelopes, and the parking configuration are consistent with these development standards.

Design Review:

Section 17.62.050 of the Zoning Ordinance requires Design Review of subdivision maps and single-family homes within the proposed subdivision. Consistent with this requirement, the applicant has submitted three house plans with two treatments for each plan. The houses range in size from 1,868 to 2,496 square feet. Four are single-story and four are two-stories.

The Residential Design Guidelines address three design principles for single-family houses. The following are the three principles, followed by staff's analysis of the applicant's efforts to meet the principle.

Site Planning - All the homes are oriented to a new cul-du-sac and are accessed off driveways from the new street. The garages are limited to 50% or less of the house width, and are setback at least five feet from the front façade to reduce their appearance. Each house has a prominent front entry identified by a roof porch. Six different treatments are proposed so that no identical model with the same treatment occurs on adjacent lots. The proposed corner lots (Lots 1 and 8) are single-story but have architectural details that are carried from the front elevation to provide a consistent design when viewed from the public right-of-way. The proposed landscaping includes a

mixture of ornamental trees, shrubs, and perennials. Shrubs are proposed along the northern-side of the fences with a side-on-treatment on Lots 1 and 8.

Massing, Transitions, and Architectural Design - The proposed architecture provides a variety of details and exterior materials that do not create any incompatible models. Four of the houses include earth-toned stucco as the base material, with stone accents, and wood trim. The other four houses include earth-toned wood siding as the base material with shingle accents, and wood trim. Roof styles include both hip and gable with either flat asphalt shingle tiles varying in color from dark brown to dark grey. The roof forms, whether hipped, gabled, or combinations thereof, are consistent in each house design, and all roofs have similar pitch. The stone accents, accent shingle siding, and wood trim are found on all four elevations. Additionally architectural details such as gable outriggers and eave brackets are carried through on all four elevations. Windows with divided-lights on the front elevation are also carried through on all four elevations. A draft condition of approval has been included that requires the use of true divided-light windows or the use of simulated divided-light windows with the grilles/muntins placed on the exterior of the window. The models are consistent in form and materials and provide an overall coherent design for the entire dwelling.

The Guidelines encourage that where more than half of the homes adjacent to a proposed subdivision are one-story, at least half of the house designs be one-story or have a predominately one-story appearance. Predominately one-story in appearance is defined as a ratio between the second-floor and the first-floor of less than 75%. Of the eight existing single-family detached homes that abut the proposed subdivision, four are single-story. The proposed subdivision matches this mix and places the four two-story homes within the interior of the site. With a 2nd Floor versus 1st Floor ratio of 72% the four two-story homes are predominately one-story in appearance.

Houses with a FAR of 0.35 or more require more careful design scrutiny to ensure compatibility with houses within 100 feet. The houses on Lots 2, 3, 6, and 7 exceed this threshold with respective FARs of 0.55, 0.54, 0.54, and 0.55. There are 10 single-family detached houses located within 100 feet of the proposed houses. Five of those houses are two-story and are similar in size to the proposed houses. Four have a comparable FAR and as such do not appear to be excessive in size. Furthermore the proposed two-story houses have a comparable amount of vertical and horizontal articulation and architectural detailed compared to the existing houses.

Materials and Color - The proposed palette of materials conveys an image of quality and durability. Four of the houses include earth-toned stucco as the base material, with stone accents, and wood trim. The other four houses include earth-toned wood siding as the base material with shingle accents, and wood trim. The roofs are covered in asphalt shingles varying in color from dark brown to dark grey.

Planning Commission Meeting Summary:

On March 20, 2014 the Planning Commission held a public hearing on this project. During the public hearing the Planning Commission requested that the applicant provide new fencing on the perimeter of the development and additional architecture on the northern elevations of the homes on Lots 1 and 8. The Commission also heard from

members of the public who voiced concern regarding the number of proposed units and the speed of vehicles travelling to the Garfield Park ball fields. As drivers that exceed the posted speed limit act separate from and independent of the proposed subdivision, staff collected the contact information of speakers to assist the Police Department in their efforts to reduce speeding. At the conclusion of the hearing the Planning Commission voted 4-0-1 to recommend approval of the application.

Required Findings:

The required findings for approval are provided in the draft resolution.

FINANCIAL IMPACTS:

No direct financial impacts to the City have been identified with this application.

CEQA:

City staff recommends that the City Council determine that the Recommended Action is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) in accordance with Section 15332 of the CEQA Guidelines (Categorical Exemptions; Class 32), which exempts in-fill development projects.

DOCUMENTS ATTACHED:

1. Attachment 1: Resolution approving a Use Permit to authorize the use of Flag Lot Development Standards; Design Review of a subdivision map, flag lots, and house plans; and a Tentative Map to subdivide a 1.42 acre property into eight single-family lots.
2. Attachment 2: Planning Commission staff report dated March 20, 2014 (without Attachment 1) with communications and draft minutes.

NOTIFICATION:

Mailing by US Postal Service on April 4, 2014 to all property owners within a 500-foot radius of the subject property; legal notices of public hearing published in the Napa Valley Register on April 4, 2014.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Staff recommends that the City Council move, second and approve each of the actions set forth below, in the form of the following motion. Move to:

1. Adopt a resolution approving a Use Permit to authorize the use of Flag Lot Development Standards; a Design Review Permit for a subdivision map, flag lots, and house plans; and a Tentative Map to subdivide a 1.42 acre property into eight single-family lots (APN 038-250-003) (PL13-0048).